

Minutes of the Seventh DCM held at Bangalore from 11th to 14th July, 1994

Sharing Session 11/7/1994

Samuel, ISI Bangalore: Indian Social Institute was started **to** support the activities in the NGO sector. ISI help organising social **action**, social movements and **indigenous people**. **Bangalore ISI** centre is **focussed to the needs of** South India,, now vigorously into Research, Documentation and Publications; language publications and documenting from regional language newspapers. Also conducting training **programmes** in social sciences, have a big social science library, which help local activists. Instead of relying **on** the primary data & **govts** reports we had a weakness **for** depending on the mainstream media. We have the problem of not having a **consistent classification system**. **The** methodology in documenting is not very important to **us, but** we see and keep **in touch with** the needs, we must keep in touch with the pulse of the people. So the staff needs sensitisation, political sensitisation for example. Access to information **is** very important and our plan is **to** collect info and share it with the **NGOs** and **activists**.

Sucharita Eashwar, Madhyam Communications; Documentation is central to

any type of work *or* organisation and the various **processes** of communication,, Our **main** target groups *are* women and **tribals**. Enables NGOs to strengthen themselves **in** their work. MC tarings **out** a journal called VOICES. We are an audio-visual resource centre for NGOs. Also provides information updates on special issues. It is a platform to shape ideas and build linkages. The documentation is made for our own internal use. We **find it** difficult to do documentation even on a specialised **basis**; maybe networking can help. We lack info.; on alternate media, where and how to get it. A database **on filmmakers** **would** be of great use in this respect.

Shabnam Virmani, Drishti: Drishti is a group **of** media professionals who came together to create dynamic video programmes depending on the context *and* the budget. We **did** a series of women **programmes** after having many sessions with women themselves. Also made some comic strips, on women **and**

legal rights as well as rural documentation through films.

Asmita, Olakh: Olakh, meaning identity, acts as a bridge between the grassroots and the mainstream. A documentation centre has been started with the hope of giving and getting hold of information,. Activities include bringing out a bi-monthly magazine, **documentation**, calendars & booklets and mobile library. The calendars for the coming year are on human rights violation on women within the family context. Documentation is done on a small scale. Started by 11 women, Olakh is not getting funds from anywhere. After seeing the uninformed grassroot We all know as to how the economic **climate** was in the wake of the Ayodhya problem. Until a government is stable and there is an optimistic wave there can never be economic clarity.

Asit: Was Nehru a real socialist?

Profs: At that particular time what Nehru and Mahalonofois did for **India** was the right, **strategy**. Nehru believed in non-alignment. What they did not realise is that the concept of **Public** Sector where capital is held by state but it is as efficient as the private sector. Sick industry **according** to Mahalnobis are to be closed. There was a shift in the Non alignment movement. The collapse of USSR. Due to it, it could not militarise as strong as United STATES. From the global prspective the political ideology was the same.

Samuel : Japan intervened so it **prospered**. How do you feel the **government** should intervene?

Prof: If we were to close our economy and go to Gandhian economy that ideology cannot survive as you cannot stop people thinking globally and there is no alternative but to open up. Then we can think how to open economy according **to** our advantage. There *arts* things in which India has competitive economy. Then they go to world market and our prices have to match up with world price. Goods to domestic product increase and the poor *are* adversely affected. We have to carefully visualise what we should import, what to export and prepare *an* action plan.

Avinash : What are the sources of getting information on on this particular topic ?

Prof: International Centre? of Growth in San Fransisco. We get this at subsidised prices. World Bank Observer, **International** Labour Organisation out fit on poor by **Dr.Aruh Ghosh**, UNDP publications, Economic and Political Weekly bibliographical notes.

Munira Sen: What *are* the ramifications of this package on the media?

PROF: Make things available for the local man. They are restricted only to few things. Local dailies should *carry* more and more related articles. Many people are not **bothered**. Peop1e who do not know should **be** informed. Compensatory **mechanism** should be **developed**.

Group Discussions

Gender Documentation: The group agreed to form *an* informal network called Women **India** Link which will share responsibilities on preparing a thesaurus on gender documentation as well as to link up with other women DCs in this effort. The group members will contact others at the local level *and* talk about this at meetings. The coordinator **of** the network will be sending out a common letter on the thesaurus. The core **group** plans to meet again in December to review its efforts.

Language Documentations Problems of collection, **translations**, dissemination and **production** came **up**. Translations and repackag ing require human exchange, need to transcreate. Suggestions to generate information from the **field** & to have training workshops one for **DCM** members and another **for** other groups. To form a translators'pool - **for** Telugu **in** H'bad, for Hindi in Delhi *and* **for Kannada** somewhere in Karnataka.

SAPs The group decided to prepare a list of available sources on SAP,to make a bibliography all the SAP **materials** and to to make a list of institutes working on SAP.

Setting up Documentation Centres: Lakshmi. **Menon** outlined the different processes involved in documentation, *viz.*,1. **understand** ing the nature, scope, objectives and targets of the organisation

2 . Collection 3. Organising, **c**lassifying, **c**ataloguing and in indexing 4. Storage **5.Retrieval** and **6.Dissemination** and information services. The members of

the group found problems with regard to each of the above processes. It was felt that they needed

training. Training could be **offered** by groups like **ISI-Bangalore**, CED-Bombay or VHAI-Delhi. But as each group has its own specific

problems, group training cannot solve the problems. It is preferable

if one trainer visit the organisations requesting training and on-site training planned to suit their specific needs. Akshara was referred to for training on women's documentation, may also consider training for other groups.

Audio—visual documentation: The group expressed the need for indepth anlysis and documentation **of mainstream** media. There should be more A/V material available in regional languages; the

possibility of adaptations and co—productions could be explored. It was agreed to prepare a resource book on audio-visuals.

14/7/94

Computer Communications - India Link

Leo Fernandez of **ISI**, Delhi and Sujit Nanda of BBS Live Wire, Bombay took the sessions on computer communiactions.

The concept of India-Link emerged in July 1989 as an outcome of the workshop on computer communication held at CED, Bombay.

Agenda for this meeting are:

- what is computer communiactions

- what *arts* the options available in getting connected between cities

535. finance and costing

-••• membership

536. resource mobilisation

Computer commmunications is mail **that** can be sent faster without a post man. It needs a telephone and a computer at the sender's end. Since physical connection between two computers across cities is not possible, the telephone lines are made use of for passing messages. One system serves as the host and the rest have the

facility to pick up messages. **E-Mail** is one to many dialogue. When the **e-mail** is gone to a group of people and **the** network has **something** common it is called Electronic Conference. With this facility Person. 1 can put in a message in the host computer. Person. 2 sends in his reply, **Person. 3** makes comments on it, thus

it becomes a conference. In email file transfer of texts and programmes is possible.

Telnet: Logging in from one system to another, commercial networks **cannot** provide this service. Assuming that, there is a network

of computers, one can use computer programmes of an area sitting in a different region. Thus while being in India one can access to the networks in California as though belonging to that network. For this one has to hop via Australia to California dialling particular codes to get into the programmes available at the network there.

Internet: It is a large global network of many smaller networks.

World Wide Web (WWW) is one such. Once you access the? programme on the WWW,ask for index or table of contents which will give you a glance and you zoom on what you want. If there is some more specific details you want, once again the WWW is given the command and you **can** avail of it after it is identified.

High Speed Link: Similar to WWW, one can only specify which area one wants the message from.

Online: You search for the info yourself while the system is connected.

Offline:Somebody other than yourself browses through the data for you pass it on to you later without being continuously connected to the system.

Internet is a network of 30 million computers world wide. It provides communications between many academic : and commercial

computers. AXcess is one of the smaller networks linked to Internet. Association for Progressive Communications, APC is a network of NGOs having host nodes in 60 countries. Internet is made use of for linking between APC networks. APC carries conferences of NGOs all over the world. APC hosted the communication at the 1993 Vienna Conference on Human Rights, they *are* planning to do the same for the Beijing Conference in '95 also.

List services is like a mailing list. For instance if one wants to participate in the women's conference in UN, even if one is not connected to that particular network one can be on the list service and the messages one requires are posted to you. India-Link is a representative partner of APC in India ,not a member. It is linked to APC via the Internet. There can be exchange of mail either directly from one host to another or via the central host to APC. In India the Bombay host is linked to APC via Green Net which is a Full **APC** Network. The central host can either **collect** messages from various hosts and pass it to APC or the other hosts can route the message to the central host. Currently India-Link has three hosts in Bombay, Delhi and Madras: leo'S unv.ernet.in / sujit@inbb.gn.apc.org / loyola@ food,unv.ernet.in.

Right now the Delhi host runs free of charge, so anyone can avial of it. Delhi host has about 100 users including 50 NGOs,

15 NGOs use Bombay and 3 5 users for the Madras host.

It is ideal to have a single host for a place. It is inconvenient to have two hosts at the same place as it might create confusion.

Host sites at various cities reduces STD and gives support services to the users of that city. Now all the cities in India are linked to ERNET which is connected to Internet & APC. ERNET, Education Research Network for educational network; but they are slowly opening up to NGOs. SIRNET is a subnet of ERNET.

Plans to have ERNET in all important cities. ISST-Delhi is directly connected to ERNET without.

India-Link. But ERNEST doesn't provide NGO dialogues which is done by India-Link. Once the link between Bombay and Delhi is established, the Green Net link between Bombay and APC will go *and* all communication going out will go via Delhi.

Commercial networks; AXcess, UUNet, ICNet etc

Most of these networks are linked directly to Internet or APC, so what happens is that if you are a member of aXcess with its host in the USA your **message** from Bangalore to Bombay goes via the USA which is charged at a higher rate. The commercial networks provide only **E-Mail** service, they 'are not capable of running Telnet and Electronic Conference services.

Equipment requirements:

A computer, modem, telephone and **software**.

Computer -8086/486/8088/80286

Modem of 2400 bps - 240 words per second are transferred. The host must be connected to a .14400 bps modem

Softwares; Commercial software eg Procom, Bit.com

Shareware software (ideal) eg Telix, 3.21, Odyssi
Freeware software Not tested

Fax Modem: Internal & External

In internal fax **modem** card which has three points is inserted **in** the computer. The external fax modem sits separately beside **the** computer. It is more convenient as it has indicator lights to show whether you are getting connected. **But** it is bulky and needs cable connection. Internal on the other hand is cheaper by 20%

Connecting a fax machine to a computer is not very practical.

is also possible, but it

Now all computers are being **sold** with fax modems which does not

cost more than 5 or 10 US **dollars**. **Winfax** Version 4 is recommended. One can directly fax messages from the computer by giving the command to fax without first getting a printout that is to be faxed to the receiver. One can also get the benefit of STD rebate by directing the computer to send the fax at, say, 10 pm.

You *can* also send a fax on your letterhead. The letterhead data and signature? if necessary, must be captured on your computer so that **it** gets printed out. For this one has to fax some matter printed on your letterhead with the signature from any local fax machine, keeping your computer open to receive messages

Once the image gets captured on your machine retain the letterhead and signature,, store it in a particular file and use when necessary.

Fax server; This software runs very closely to that of **the** computer,, **When** you don't have a fax modem, you can send an **E-mail** to

the host who in turn can send the fax for **you**. The only problem arises when the receiving end is engaged or when one can't get through the host,

Modem models:

1. ZXYEL
2. Multi-Tech
3. USR Sportex
4. INTELSATIS**FACTION**
- 5.

COSTS

in K : 1K = **Rs.1000/-**

Computer

Host Cost

386 system **Rs.40K** 250 MBHard disc **RAM 4-8 mB**

User

any computer

Cost

Modem

Software

14.4 K Fax

Rs.11-20K

2400 -9600

bps **with MNP**

Telex

Rb.S-11

K

No cost

Operational STD **Rs.2K** per Local calls

month Modem

Licence fee - **Rs.300/year Rs.300/**

year

Subscription to a host costs around **Rs-2000/-** per year.

Requirements:

Host User

Technical support Motivation

Usersupport Hunger for info.

Info needs of NGOs Skills to use the basic

Popularity -**computer** operations

Discussions :

Sujit Nanda: Computer communications *are* useful but the usership is at the roots. The users have not contributed to the movement of computer **communications**. What needs to be done '? Newsletters, training **programmes** for users *??

Sucharita Eashwar: You need to build **up** the user base. We need more information **on** things like India-Link. Build up more **awareness** and organise workshops on E-mail and computer **communi**-cations.

Saravanan: In fact many people **have** modems but do **not know** which network to use like **I-net**, Geo Net **or** Tool Net,,

workers the need was felt to operate at the grassroots level and need based activities. Apart from calendars all other activities *are* in

plan stage. Olakh is also **planning** to network with other NGOs to pool in resources for a mobile library .

Jayashree Joshi, Chetna: CHETNA is Centre for **Health**, Education, Training, Nutrition Awareness. Target groups women and **children**. **Started** in .1980 affiliated to the Nehru Foundation for Development **Ahmedabad**. **Chetna tribes**. fee

achieve its objectives by direct and indirect modes, training people

involved in Health and **Nutrition**. **acts** as a liaison between the grassroots and policy makers. **Chetna** brings out two publications, the? quarterly Chetna News and the Information Brochure. The library has about 4000 books. Developed a variety of training materials on health education and nutrition. **Library** is open to all in three **languages**, Gujarati, Hindi and English. CDS-IS1S package used for computerised documentation. New decimal **classification** followed. Give information to researchers, NGOs and other interested people. Specialised master training **available to those** interested in the areas of child, health,, educa-

tion and documentation. Training on **documentation** is for User Training-

how to use Chetna Library. Other trainings-gender sensitisation, adolescent training, communication skills in theatre and puppetry **etc**. We are part of inter library-loan-link.

John D'Souza, CEDs A centre **for** documentation **started in**

1974. Documentation is specialised the sole activity, documentation done systematic, **cally** on a daily basis. Specialised **in** doc services, **CED is** professional, and hence systematic. Clippings from **1979** is available; **the** classification **is** stable but expanding depending **on** the need of the day. The first section of the **documentation** is the

clippings; we *are*: more known for our clippings. It covers 700 categories of topics and important issues. The next section is the books numbering around 9000. Third section is the NGO and govt. reports. Then comes the **journals** which *are* indexed. We do not prepare **abstracts**, only make descriptives. CED follows the same classification for all the sections i.e., the same code is used for news clippings, reports, books

and video **cassettes**. **but** the file code is different. CED is open-

accessed & computerised. Even new debates are filed under proper mother codes. All the books, reports and journals are indexed in the DCM format in DBF" in Foxbase. Video cassettes about 100 *are* copied, the copy is available for borrowing, master is retained,, Cassettes *are* charged,, Doc post, service is available through requests on the mail. Xerox

materials *are* sent via the post. CED is also an outlet for NGO publications, 250 titles from the NGO sector are kept for **distribution**. CED doesn't have inter library loan facility.

Chetna volunteered to give **guidelines** for inter library loan to CED, CED to circulate it among participant members.

Lalith Jain, Astha's Astha documentation centre has 2000 **books, paper-clippings, reports** and audio & video cassettes. It gives training in social change- TOT (Training of **Trainers**). **Project** works., Field Adult Education, Health, Women's development, Wages etc. The training courses extend from 1-9 days. Adult Education training given to NGOs active in

national issues. The national documentation centre has a comprehensive collection **of** AICUF movements especially those concerning the student. A collection of 2650 books,, 75 journals & 4 dailies. Student News is a bi-monthly publication. Information is given out to all other centre of AICUF. Other activities include **conducting training** programmes and **seminars**. AICUF is not politically **motivated**.

CP Jayalaxmi, Co-ordination Unit for Beijing Meet Sept. '95; Working on **gender** issues. To get maximum **representation by** grassroots movement in such meetings as the Beijing one. Recommendations of such **meetings** finally **becomes** policy papers. This is a way to make inroads into govt. policies. We work out methods to get inter linkages between women groups. We operate on a commercial E-Mail **network** to get all the? women **groups** interlinked to form a powerful representation.

Laxmi Menon, Akshara In 1987 developed the Akshara classification system starting with our own material «Officially set. up in 1994 at **Dadar**. **Involved** in reports & publishing in non-academic languages. Akshara has brought, out a 'Manual for Information **Process**' called " Us«&~jYour Head " **It** helps in information processing. **By** this December

we will become functional, we have decided against keeping news **clipp**

ings * videos and academic research material because **of** having **CED & SNTD** in **Bombay**. We will have documents, **seminar papers, journals** etc Target group is women;, focussing on the issues **of** health and labour, to serve as a bridge between the mainstream media and grass-root, issues

We offer training in setting up documentation **centres** especially **for** women's issues. Depending on the requirements of the trainee organisation the training is for one day to three months. The prim6?aim_of

Akshara is to be independent of a **professional** librarian. Our classifi

cation is not standardised,, it requires **modifications** as per the needs We develop course modules and publish booklets which are for sale. Akshara translates its own publications into **Marathi**.

The question of **duplications** Having the same books is not duplication. They should be available to the needy. Duplication arises when labour is duplicated.

John: Having **easily available** information is no sin, each NBO is *"\ |r^r uniquely special and hence contributes a lot to their special view. % Duplication of labour **becomes** essential as sharing involves many practical problems whose modalities have to be arrived at first.

Lakshmi was requested to collect and distribute the expensive publications, journals and other reference collections from other countries

as she has a better access to it.

Yamuna, Equations". Equations is a documentation &. research centre?

working mainly on tourism. We **have** two quarterlies, the Documentation Update? based on news clips and the Alternate Network Letter . We mark 5 newspapers. Equations has **compiled** information on **women** and tourism.

filed by Britto J, I & h w & n i K & n d r & t Doing **documentation** and **research** on tribals", using computer logic with human hands. Documents newspaper clippings, reports and other literature covering 15 subjects. We have **national** and **regional level** understandings with other groups. We monitor serious literature from journals mostly **on** religion and its-combination with politics. Even materials from foreign journals *are*

annually.Our classification is standard with a traditional index. Concept category is in alphabetical order; journal articles *are* on concept *cards and* easily retrievable.

12/7/94

Ramnani Rao, ISST Delhi: It is a research **organisation** though the focus on research has **changed** from time to time. Document art. ion centre started from .1.981. Most of the collection *cit~&* unpublished materials and seminar papers used **by** researchers. We avoid duplication by not collecting material available **elsewhere.** **Receive** journals related to women's issues. Also has 5-6 years' clippings from 4 newspapers *a.rr~anged* **subjectwise.** Back volumes of periodicals *are* kept., now thinking of weeding out old issues. We? find it difficult to use a standard classification system, we use only key-words; catalogue *arranged* according **to** the key-words. Prepare bibliographies. ISST Bangalore specialise on Panchayati. Raj and conduct training for women elected to panchayats. Though based in Delhi we have **difficulties** in getting **govt.** reports.

On Thesaurus - **RRs** Thesaurus is not **srictly** followed, all the? key

words *are* alphabetically arranged in the catalogue, Laxmi Menon s . Some international **as** well as Indian groups have developed thesaurus. Even at DCM we were developing one, 1 don't know what, happened to it.

Minal Khedkar..TISSs The Women's Studies Unit of TISS was started in .1981 with UBC grant, but the documentation centre's grant comes from the Ford **Foundation.** That's why 1 call myself an **N60. Basically** it is an academic 1 i.brary **catering** to **MSW & Ph.D students and the** faculty members. Besides outside academics foreigners and **a** few NGOs make use **of** the doc centre. We don't get many **journals** since the TISS library has most of **them.** **Books** about 2000 and nearly 2000 pamphlets arranged subjectwise in **boxes.** **Various** newsletters from NGOs and women's studies c e n t r e s a r r a n g e d a l p h a b e t i c a l l y . **Newspapers** **a r e a r r a n g e d i n t o s u b j e c t f i l e s ,** if they *are* old, they are kept **as** bound **volumes.** **We** conduct refresher courses for UGC and Academic Staff colleges., In 19635 published a directory of Services for Women.in Bombay.Prepared annotated bibliographies **on** women & work?health,religion and law. **It** is available to outsiders also.We follow the **CDS—ISIS** scheme for annotations. Govt. documents come to the TISS library,; if anybody wants any such reports which is not available to them we can copy it.We service queries through mail, A **list** of video cassttes *are* available with the A-V **unit** of TISS,,

Pamela Fernandes,Jagruti Kendra: We want to organise our library.It has no classification system. It is aimed at broadening the awareness among our target groups - women,youth & children **in** the neighbourhood.

The entire area of our work **is in** slums and chawls. Ours is a primi

tive documentation,; catagorised books and journals under broad sections

pertaining to our work like health,law etc. We have one publication in the form **of a six-monthly** report,,Jagruti Kendra was initiated by a priest and a nun five years ago. We have a staff of .14 para-professionals; only two of them are professional MSWs.We identify leaders from the community and train them. Work in five places in **Bombay** with a mass base **of** women;in the credit society there *are a* lot of women **members.We are documenting** the process of our work. To evaluate our work we are interviewing a lot of Jagruti Kendra's

Jyotirmayee K, Alternatives for India Developments AID is UK based, with the national head quarters in Madras **operating** in Tamil Nadu, Madhya Pradesh and Bihar. Our thrust areas are education, health and environment. We publish Grassroots Action journal annually, it is going to come out **quarterly**. The special issues so far were on Girl **child, Education** for Liberation & Dalits. The next issue is on **Indegenous** People. 13/7/94

Reggie Gomez, INSAFs It is a social action group working on children, women, dalits, adivasis and human **rights**. We formed a commission which prepares paperis on our perspectives on these issues-At the National conference? agenda for the issues were set out. 60 . NGOs **attended** the meeting and discussed problems at the state level-Each state should have their own conventions. We **also** have workshops and plans of action for the year, one such is the Children's Report of Goa. We do not want to have a big documentation centre as there *are* already a number of them in **Goa**.

Shubro Roy, CYSD; Centre for Youth and Social Development was started in 1987/. We **dream** of a self-sufficient **society, to excel** for the poor, their participatory methods, people-' s organisations and sustainata.il.ity.

Ours is a three—fold role of enabler implementor *and* disseminator. We have? 3000 books, 100 journals and news paper clippings in Oriya. We bring out publications in Oriya, some of the Action Aid booklets were translated into Oriya. We have lending facility; students of the Utkal University *are* the main users. I want to know how to **index** journals.

Leslie Rodricks, Vikas Adhyan Kendras We *are* a group of people who were? with BUILD, a left-oriented organisation. With the collapse of the USSR, we shifted over to analysing the present socio-economic problems, documentation & dissemination, seminars and trainings., We deal with dal its, women ,chi Idren , adivasis , fundamental ism etc . Three? putal i cat ions -Viklp, Action Goods and **Theoretical** Journal. We have a highly modified classification system, has a number easily stored and retrievable in the computer. Ours is more of a research than documentation centre, it is more for our own use *and* reference. We have a collection of 2000 books, we **started** indexing EF'Ws recently. Artieles, pamphlets and booklets *are* given- a standard classification number. Our daily clippings *are* highly catagorised consisting of **editorial**, features and comments. We do not keep them as **CED** is there. We have eliminated the card catalogue. Books we buy are? **relevent** to the? areas we work on . Our publications *ar~e* translated into Gujarathi and Hindi, now people **demand** it in Msrathi also. The next issue of the journal, "New **Perspectives**" is going to come out in **English** and tiarathi. We conduct symposia, workshops and seminars; one problem we find with seminars is transcribing them.

Asha Dixit, Disha Kendra; Our work is mainly related to educational activities especially adult education. We also organise mass marriages. We do not have a documentation centre.

Lakshmi R, CRY: We support 80 projects all over India»Documentation is a non-financial support with a collection of .1500 books and 40 journal. We work mostly on children's, especially street children's issues. Other areas *are*

women,health and income generation, we have a project meeting once in six months,,Our doc centre is in Bombay which is **used**

Christu John ^YMCA! Our library is an academic one., we had given away our collection to UGC. Since one year we have collected 5-6 thousand books. We got some documents from CED **also.** We follow **the Dewey** classification system. We *are* processing the materials as we *are* still collecting them. We plan **to** bring out publications after two years.

Madhusudan₃CWCs **CWC** has four programmes; the rural programme in South Kanara, Ankur-'-Bangalore programme, Documentation & Research **pgmm—CARD** &. Field programme in **Kundapur**. Our documents are mainly in English. It is shared by other MGOs. As information is flowing we have a new info cell to decide which info should go where. Our doc and info centres *are* different. We bring out Molake newsletter and Bhima Patrike, a wallpaper for working children. Bhima is **translated** and circulated in Bombay also. We have a series of A-V cassettes, on campaigns like last year's on Varahi Parichaya; an environmental campaign on migration

problems of children.

Our documentation centre also has films; we made one on agriculture and its related problems on children called "Jujukan thakali",

We train children in certain crafts and other activities. "Devarakadu" is another movie we have produced which is a national award winner. Documentation centre of CWC was used to get information on this.

Alex V, Dalit Research Centres Dalit Research Centre is four year old having 1050 books, periodicals and **paper** clips classified under fifteen subjects. We conduct seminars and publish books based on them. 90% of them *are* in English and the rest in Tamil. We **also** have a **few** materials in Marathi,

Ramakanth, Integrated Rural Dev. of Weaker Sections in India, WIDA's Work with dalits, tribals and other weaker sections on issues of land, women economic development, community development programmes, skills assistance, health programmes etc. Health staff work in 130 villages covering } immunization and nutrition programmes. Community development **pgmmes** *arm* done through films, videos, slides and puppetry. We brought out a literary primer in Oriya. WIDA gives financial assistance to students & women. With the help of the Dept. of Science & Technology we give training in making baskets, brooms and ropes. We **conduct**

workshops on Eucalyptus plantations. Our doc. centre has 2000 books, documentation is not yet computerised.

J B Rajan, PCCh Programme for Community Organisations is aimed **at** the education, training, info dissemination, research and documentation **of** fisherfolks. We do fisheries related documentation. We have 3000 **books** » **1300** reports, 32 **English** and 12 Malayalam journals? we subscribe

8 newspapers. We follow our own classification on fisheries Kerala

fisheries, National fisheries and World fisheries. We have? paper clips mainly on

fisheries *and* a few other subjects and videos under various topics. PCO publishes research reports and get them translated to Malayalam.

Radha Kunke, LAYAi! LAVA is a resource centre for tribals engaged in

survey. Similarly we have managed **to get** the land records from **govt. sources.** The info is maintained in computerised database. We also conduct para-legal training to tribal youths **with** respect to the land alienation issues. Documentation of herbal medicines is also done. In 1991 we organised an environment padayatra of 52 days,, That was process **documented** in the form of a book, later it **was** translated **to Telugu** but **yet** to find a translator for Oriya. Another programme is **the** video documentation **with** CED aimed at generating dialogues **among** the tribal communities.

Munira Sen Madhyams Set up in 1983 Madhyam documents folk forms, dalit, tribal, women and **children's** issues on video. Produced a video on girl child called **GIRIJA**, it's been made in five **languages** Our field activists *are* based in five regions - Assam, AP, **Delhi, Karnataka** and ??

Asit CISEC: Ciset: is a specialised group doing radiation studies. It is a collective of **ex-student** of JNU and Calicut Medical College, film makers, feminists **and** lawyers. I am doing a **project** on the

political economy of **health**. We deal only on radiation and occupa-

tional health,, We had done the first study on the Indian Rare **Earths'** radiation; analysed blood samples from 50,000 households **for** radioactivity levels. We set up an Ayurvedic Hospital called Pratiksha Now doing a study on genetic aberration on 30 pregnant, volunteers.

12/7/94

Presentation on Language Documentation - The Interface Between DCs and

Action Groups by **Usha Rao** /> v

A. ACTION GROUPS

(I

1. Action Groups & Readership

The language of reading: In **many** voluntary agencies only the project, head may have access to English. **If** it is a large project, some of **the** senior staff too can read English while? the rest have access only to the regional language. In recent times in a large number of small organisations **even** the project head has access only to the regional language. So **most** of the staff in action groups can read *and* write only the regional language.

Access to readings Though access **to** regional language or mother **tongue** is given to every member of *any* social group, the access to reading in

regional **language** is not readily available. Given the relative poverty of resources **available** to the languages in India with the notable exception of Malayalam and Bengali, even those having university education **are** not necessarily habitual readers of documents. **If** this is the

case with project heads *and* senior staff,, most, field level workers come out of *very* poorly resourced schools. Very few of them *are* readers and some even profess *a* distaste for **reading**.**They** denounce reading saying that it is not. a socially useful productivity. Some hold that, practical /experiential learning alone has value., On the whole volags suffer **from** lack of reading and some of these attitudes are the result of **non** availability of **material** that relates to their concerns.

Access to referring; Of the readers, most read for pnt-pri-air-

read what easily comes their way. The ability to seek information by referring to a library or documentation centre is indeed rare. This is

a very important skill if one is to use a doc centre or library. Most people who can read but *are* not habitual readers is because they don't know what book **can** interest them or where they can find them. This is more true when they work in remote areas where there is no library or collection of books that they can choose from.

The potential for promoting readership **among** the action **groups** Trainers and project leads **give a great deal of emphasis** on trainings and workshops- This form of learning is of great value, but if it is not supported **by** learning through reading; it means the activist has to depend on his or **her** own learning. **If there is** no active effort to promote **reading, then** the activist? takes no initiatives **in self-learning**! **The** activist, gets **exposed** to only the set. of materials that the trainer is able to share. It is important for the activist to have a wider exposure so that she can **see** the work **in** that context and arrive at a mature perspective.

Activists are relatively more concerned about, people and society. It is easier to arouse their curiosity and desire for further knowledge. Thus it is much easier to develop readership among them than **in** any other groups in society.

2. Action Groups as Sources of Documents!

In most organisations activists, trainers and project heads *are* producing reports and other materials. But they are **all** seen as internal documents. It is important that activist see their work as part of **socio-political** & economic trends, see that their experiences hold valuable information and knowledge for a whole lot of other groups. An activist is best able to relate to the **the** work of another activist doing similar work. No other writing, however refined and solid its contents might **be, is** going to strike a chord **as** much as the story of another soul in the same boat. So documentation by activists itself **is** a very important source for documentation centres who wish **to** cater to the activists"; ~ "

B. DOCUMENTATION CENTRES Origin, History and Form

Documentation **centres** originated with **the** need to collect and preserve documents of historical importance. Even **in** India documentation centres **started** in English. The focus was on collection and classification. They catered to a scholarly clientele who were well-read and very much capable of using a **library**. **The** doc centres have come a long way since then. The **books** now chosen reflect progressive thoughts and are **people-oriented**. But it is still shackled by its history in its preoccupation with collection and classification; it still continues **to be** predominantly in English. Even **regional language** centres are doing it along with English and continues to cater to researchers and policy makers. Documentation for action groups is an area yet to be addressed. ~ ~ "

■ruTcccArc rerruiPF'ixi THE ACTION GROUPS & DCs

1.

Languages Most, of the doc centres *are* in English, even regional language doc centres do it along with English. For example, DEEDS has been able to find very little published material in Kannada. Despite sincere efforts to keep material in regional languages dot-centre s a r e p r e d o m i n a n t i n E n g l i s h.

2. The Reach: Most activists have **come** across very limited variety of books. Most of them are from rural backgrounds, some **places even** news papers *ar*& not available. At best they have come across fiction and magazines. They are totally unused to the idea of reading **on** develop, issues and reading **to** further knowledge.

En v i r on **men** 11

3. Lack of In most areas children don't, get to see books
other than" ged **text** books. And where books are avilable they *are* **discoura**
saying **it is** a waste of time. It is very difficult for **an** adult **to** acquire reading habits, at
least it requires **a lot** of effort, **on** somebody's part to reach books to them,, coax
and tempt them **to** read, keep track **of** their likes and interests and carefully
select books for them

least
a for
promot
towards **it**. h e
s¹¹ a n t b e
g_in -

The promoter would have to ensure that the new **reader** gets **at** few highly satisfying experiences of reading and gets a taste? reading. So far our documentation centres have not considered ing reading among **low-reading** groups and *are* not geared They *are* meant for those seeking info but not for the

4. Quality of material in DCs; Usually DCs have clippings, books,

journals and **magazines** and the more widely circulated reports and papers. Newspaper clippings contain bits and pieces of information, A person who already has some knowledge of it is able to relate it **to** other known facts. **But** someone with little background to it will not, get a satisfying reading from it. Books and journals are way beyond the reach of an **average** activist. They may not be the **greatest on** the subject and the activist can't get anything out of it. As most of the things are printed materials the activist cannot access to **it**; they are addressed to people with higher education,, Documentation centres **do** not have materials corresponding to the activists' needs - that, in simple language, limited vocabulary and are comprehensive and complete in themselves. The average activist does not have the kind of educational **background** to understand a language using a very large vocabulary **and** a complex form.

D, WHAT NEEDS TO BE DONE ?

1. Reach: The doc centre should take the initiative to reach the appropriate material to the activists. DCs should help action groups **to**

establish a library and reading room. The library should have at least a minimum number of books and materials covering its **area of work**. **The**

material should be very carefully selected and it must be very much

readable and **relevant** to the activists. Within the DCs we need to

develop our expertise; we should be good at assessing the reading skills **and the needs** of the group.

DCs should work with a set of action groups and should offer exposure

workshops, user friendly packages, info **dissemination**, reaching

selected material for programmes and sub-centres. The objective of the

material that can be easily read, providing an opportunity for the activist to have very positive post-reading experience and developing reference skills., DCs should develop packages of material to be used for specific programmes. The objective is to make it accessible to the trainers who do not have much ideas on locating suitable material. It can include posters and audio-visuals,. DCs must have wide range of classified lists. These lists should be widely published~and circulated It s h o u l d b e o f v e r y s p e c i f i c a r e a s a n d f o r s p e c i f i c r e a d e r s h i p s . T h e user should be able to straightaway locate **what** is appropriate to **him**.

Reaching selected material for programmes is a good working arrangement **with** the groups. The group keep the DC informed **of** its training calendar and other events. The DC takes the responsibility of reaching appropriate reading material for the participants. The trainer or project head may need material to refer to while designing the programme. The services can be **of two kinds**: a knowledgeable person sends requests for specific material and the DC responds to it. The **group** can ask the DC to select and send the material that they need. The **material** can be reached and returned by post. The group may also require a person to integrate reading exercises. DCs should be able to send good resource **persons** if the action group has a well used library then the DC can consider that as a sub-centre. The DC acts as the

source 1 library. At a time about **100** books and other documents can be lent; these **can** be exchanged after a suitable period **for** a fresh **lot**.

2. Collection of Appropriate Material: Activists are able **to** relate to the work of another activist doing similar **work**. The **reports** and writings of activist *are* important sources of documents. If it is a matter of communicating new ideas to activists, it is done through various **workshops**. Here the trainer is making valuable efforts to communicate in the language and idiom that is understandable to the activists. Such workshops ought to be documented and these *are* perhaps the most valuable of documents. Similarly there is a great need for backgrounders and articles which present the subject in a comprehensive **manner**. After reading such material it becomes easy **to** assimilate new **information**. Such articles should form part of the basic minimum library among action groups.
3. Efforts **to Generate** Appropriate Materials Till now not much thought and effort has been made to create materials for activists. It requires **special** efforts to generate awareness and to equip people with the skills to do so.

English has been through a Basic **language movement**, a good amount of literature was created **using** a vocabulary of about 850 words **with** another 100-150 **words** added **in** the cases of technical subjects. Our regional language **too** need some efforts of this kind. Materials should be created for activists using a limited vocabulary of 1000 **words**.

Most **activists** are made **to** write some form of **report**. Usually the pressure

comes from otrEsIde and is passed down the line. Writing and documenting one's work and the work of the collective is a very important, act of reviewing, critiquing and setting directions for one's work. **Documenting** must be primarily for oneself and then it can be of value to others too. DCs need **to** train action groups to document for their own use; the training should help them develop their **writing** skills.

There *are* always people who write on subjects of interest to the

activists. They need a sense of the target audience to be able to write for them. DCs could arrange for such interactions. Over the process of communicating ideas to this group the writer will get a sense of content, and form that is **appropriate**. Such interactions generate good documents.

DCs can generate secondary literature that *are* useful to **the activist**. It can be reviews of series of articles **on** a topic, reviews of very good reports, training materials, books or newsletters. These can be circulated as list of documents or as part of newsletters with wide circulation.

Often it is suggested and attempted that if there is not enough good material available in regional languages resort to translations. There is an inherent problem with **translations**. **When** something gets **written** in English, it is addressed to a group with a certain level of education, experience and knowledge **base**. All this is taken into account while writing the original. When the same gets translated it becomes unreadable **except**, to readers of English. The translator should try and communicate the idea to a representative target readers. On the

basis of this experience it should be translated and adapted, Transla

tors with a sense of the audience already in the mind *are rare*. Hence it becomes important to arrange for such interchanges to occur in person and then document it.

4. Some Important Considerations in Documentations

All work done in the **regional** languages must first be documented in that language itself. It has value **primarily** for people who worked to create it and then for others who know that language. It will be of **secondary** importance to those who do not know the language. The work done by the activist is used to develop theories, **draw** future policies etc. But the activists themselves *are* kept inaccessible to it. We in **documentation** centres must try to change this trend.

Writing is for oneself. Documenting is **an** act of enriching oneself and one's work. **But** practised in the form of being accountable to another reduces it to an unwanted chore. Asking a person to write must be in the spirit, of helping him/her to think and grow.

To sum up lots need to be done: collect all the unimportant looking

reports — they *are* important for the readers. Locate resource persons

and organise workshops on writing in simple language with limited vocabulary, **backgrounders** and documenting for the **activists** and action groups and cater to their needs of the written **materials**. They in turn can feed the DC with documents generated by them, **Avoid** translations, **instead document** **actua** **l communication**. Help action groups to develop forms of reporting **and** documenting their work. Focus on readership as DCs principle goal, then everything else will fall in place.

Documentation centres for activists is in a sense like putting the cart before the horse. Readership **starts** with transit.1 on a 1 **literature. Promoting** school and public libraries *and*. getting the? activists use them is of prime importance. The? urge to learn from books can come only after attaining a level of ease in reading books coupled with knowing where to find **what** books. The ease in reading comes from reading a great number of racy books-- short stories, novels, simple poetry, film songs, epics, plays,, stories and plays in verse.

-\

Discussions".

Radha; We find that village level activists are not comfortable **with** reading and writing. So **we** prefer to do our trainings orally *and* to have" the **reports** orally. * -

Ushas Training programmes *are* **important** and serve a certain purpose **But** **it** cannot replace reading, it is important that we should encourage them to read. '

Radha: We have a system whereby activist groups discuss and a social workers listen and record.

Ushas Reading and writing are sources of power which makes it very **important** that people develop the skills of reading and **writing**

Radhas How do you make a field based activist, write ? If the activist shares and someone else writes it can help? it is a sensible solution.

Ushas It is important for the activist to write because it helps to reflect,

Shabnam: I agree with it.

Radha: Activists have their own **way** of communicating, **reading** is not a part of **their** culture.

Vijayendras What this implies is we have to help the **tribals** get them integrated into the mainstream. Example, formal education for tribals.

x Non-formal education does not lead to providing all aspects of formal education.

Asit: I am critical of formal education. Will the tribals not become pillars of bureaucracy with formal education "? Do you want to **educate** or **iterate** ?

RadhasLet us come to the point. We *are* deciding the basic means of communicating **while** documenting.

Johns Resistance to reading and writing has been emphasised by Usha's **lecture**. All agencies have good training pgmms. Documents of the training pgmms has to be **communicated** to **the** groups.

Laxmi: Let. **us** focus on what needs to be concretely done.

Avinash: MCS should have a field for deciding the level of readership of the book.

John; We have a kind of field, we *are* half way through that.

Radhusudhans Translation of related literature? needs vocabulary of technical terms

John; Bovtii has made a dictionary of technical **terms**.

Vijayendras There is a need to restrict vocabulary **to** help! the common

man react. In 1930 IA Ricahrdson started Basic Language, he found that only 850 words *are* needed to explain all difficult words which *are* about 20,000; like " Lady Bird" series and " Ladder"series *are* in simple English.Hindi became more difficult after Independence, Example AIR. Structure of Hindi is in English, therefore there is a need for a

more democratic language-

XYZ s LAnguage is becoming difficult because of language movements.

Madhusudhan: There is need for standardised terms **to** understand **the** efforts of each other.

Shirdi Prasads Language of fourth **standard level** is being used in our **pu b l i c a t i o n s** .

Vijayendra: In order to help people read we should look for how people grew through reading. Their **autobiographies** provide a lot of insight.

i/john: Need to stress on how action groups can develop reading/writing potential of activists.

Laxmi: Our job is also to give information to activists , for this we need to get in touch with who is doing what.

Leslie: CED can be a link betwen the activists and groups who *are* into

documentation.

Others: Why CED ? All **of** us.

Presentation on Language Documentation by Umashankar

I will be very brief. I am **not** from the documentation groups, I am with the activists at the field and am talking from **that** point of view An activist is somebody who is more at the field than at the office. Ffy ^sTvarTng~of the training workshops for activists is about documentation. There-? *are* two forms **of documentation** **5** one written and **the** other audio-visual. For an **activist** **the** more important thing to do is **network** ing and communicating. Then why regional language documentation ? Because activists *ar<s* very poor in (English; the alienation of having to read books in **English** for the rural based activist is *very* frustrating. This is why there is a need to have documentation **in** local languages. As a trainer our slogan was **Not to Couleet« Efut to Crea.te fiateria** 1 s .

Documentation centres *are* **anti-activist, centralised &. mystified**.

There is a need to produce **documents** for the activist. The best and only person to do so the activist. The communication of the activist is oral, he wouldn't engage in intellectual discussions. There is also another myth that the activist doesn't write.If there has to be some training done for the activist we

have **to** take into account **the** oral traditions of the activists. These w/shops were used to explore the skills in writing and reading. Our group, " Trainers Collective" had organised a w/shop on Creative Writing, There were a lot of exercises planned for **the** w/shop. It had six components s writing Letters, Reports

Articles & features, **Dialogue**, drama & script, Short stories, Poetry and **Translations**.

Each of the 16 trainees were asked **to** write 16 different kinds of letters *and* to post them. They were all genuine letters. After writing them they were read out and the **best** one in each of the 16 categories were published in a booklet form. Dialogue writing was difficult., then two persons did the dialogues and it was written,

Neo-literates like a lot of colour materials *and* photographs. They will not **bother** about the mere formats, **they** can discriminate the contents; they will go for what they **like**. **A booklet** on the discrimination of the girl child called Heeqekke Heereeti ? came out through different stages in 4 years, At first it was prepared for **Manila Samakhya**, later it was adapted for the Total Literacy **Programme** as calendar, it was reprinted again, once again it changed its shape to chart format. It is these kind of materials that enrich DCs at region level >

Tape recorders and video were used in Public Speech Course. It was recorded and **played** back to the trainees. Workshop on puppetry was shot, on slides and the Manclal elections in 1983 in tribal areas was shot on VHS and edited to 20 minutes,,

DCs should decentralise themselves at the project **areas** and the field. Documentation for an activist must be produced from the activities of the activists, **Reading** and writing **among** them is very **important**. The one engaged in documentation should not be an indifferent person; the main job is to **recreate experiences** into documents.

Presentation on SAP by Prof. Krishna Kumar-Let me just mention to you that I happen to have some interface with **NGOs** already. So I have some idea about the kind of audience I am addressing. Another reason why I accepted the invitation is that, normally I tend to sit in my office and have abstract version of SAP; very rarely I get an opportunity to do field work to get an idea of the ground realities,, Knowing fully well that NGOs *s.t~B* quite active

and they know the ground realities very well, I thought if I share **my** views with you and maybe spent lot of time after that for discussions,

CJ

then I may learn a lot from you **which** may improve my own perceptions of what kind of impacts. I am already amazed by the trees and branches

C)

identifying various components of **SAP**.

I do not know how many of you have read **my** paper **in EPW**, normally I don't write in things **like EPW**; I write in economic journals. I consider **EPW** to **be a** general, left oriented political magazine and I never wanted myself to have either a left orientation or a right orientation but **an** objective scientific, orientation to

economics. But it is hard **on** me after having several years of objective scientific research that you cannot be? **an** economist without looking **at** the political economy angle. But only about three four years ago I realised that one must look at economics at a political economic angle.

And my **first** piece was on SAP which I was provoked to write because I

feel most of my colleague economists have been misrepresenting **facts**, have been **blindly** following what, we were told to do than **impar**tially examine it. This is what prompted me to write that paper; a paper which is different from much of my writings,, I' **had been** writing more than 60 papers in national and international journals. But I am very happy for having written that paper in EPW because that reflects c hange i n my own a ll i tud es and pe rc e p t i o n s t o w a r d s e c o n o m i c s. For some of you who have read that paper, perhaps what I am going to say today is repetition. **But** at the same time, it. is one thing to **read** a paper and another thing to discuss issues face to face. So I would like to beg your pardon if anything that I am going to say is obvious to you.

Let me start off from 1929, In 1929 there was a big crash of the

world depression. Most of the countries were worried about, the depre

ssion and wanted to do something about it so that, that kind of a catastrophe would not happen again. That was the time? John Meynard Keynes, a famous economist, wrote a theoretical framework; in that framework he identified a major role for the govt; to intervene **in** the

working of the economy and said the state should intervene through controlling, say for example, credit and creating demand. These *are* the

two types -• fiscal and monetary policies. So creating demand through fiscal policy and controlling money supply and price etc through the monetary policy. But when he saw the kinds of problems the world was going through he was so much concerned about the? world that he said that his theory has no value unless that theory was applied to the **critical** problems that the world was facing at. that time. So he was very much instrumental in putting down on paper the proposal **to** estab **lish** the? two Brettanwood institutions, namely the International **Monetary Fund** (IMF) and the World Bank,, When he proposed to establish these two institutions many people mainly govts including his own in the UK were not. really enthused to have that. But **what** happened fortunately was that some international banking community in America saw selfish interest in that proposal. So what they did was the international bankers in the USA put sufficient political pressures within the USA more or less to accept in principle the proposal put forth by J M Keynes. As a result IMF" & **WB** were established in .1944 as two mu ll i l a t e r a l **insti** t u t i o n s » ll is very necessary f or us today **because** we **read** in most of the newspapers and in popular articles that most of

C j

these policies we adopt in our countries *are* thrust on us by IMF & WB. If that is the case we need to **know** what, is the framework and what

L)

institutions **ere** developing these? policies. This will be my major-focus of discussion this afternoon.

For example when these institutions were established through a charter they said that these institutions would have a board of governors and executive

directors. They said there would be 12 executive directors. Out of 12 executive directors 5 would come from countries which have the maximum amount of foreign exchange reserves deposited with the IMF. That means, you can understand, the richest countries having the **maximum** amount of foreign deposits those have the drawing

rights on IMF. Those few countries would have 5 permanent representat

ives. And in addition they said, this is the IMF charter, the charter says, there is two **representatives** from the Latin **American** countries because they are close to America and all other countries would have five representatives. Then the voting would be proportionate to the

89 .BY. of the votes in IMF rest with the **developed** countries. In other words if you look at the political economy angle IMF" is predominantly controlled in its decision making by the developed countries^ so predominantly that nearly 90% of the voting rights rest with the developing countries;! only the other **107**. for the developing world. A lot of people including our finance minister Dr. Manmohan Singh say that, that is an international organisation and we have our own representatives, we are members of that organisation; all that is non-sense if you look at the? reality. There is a book written by a **legal** advisor

c ~)

to the? IMF', a book by Mr. **Bould**; he wrote on the voting behaviour in the IMF and in that book he says very clearly that the way some of our

c ■' >

/representatives like Bopi Arora who go to IMF and executive directors - **what** they do is, they are there as executive directors and members to ~~take decisions that when they sit as possible then this is to walk~~, they talk in such a way that, they would not like to offend the majority view. At best what they say is try to prevent the maximum harm that can be done perhaps some of the members in IMF can do and nothing beyond. And this is well documented by a legal advisor on how decisions *are* made.

We also must remember that the IMF decisions are governed by some other features which *are* not there in the charter of IMF" but which are

in the constitutional and legal framework of USA „ Many people don't know. When the Brettonwood institutions were started; founded in .1944, there was in the USA a Brettonwood Act of 1944. According to that act it was said that **USA** had agreed to establish those two institutions and hence those conditions *are* very important and everyone should know. Those conditions were that the USA will **have** executive directors, not anybody from the govt; , but. **the** executive directors for

the IMF &: W.B have to be selected by the President and conformed by the Congress. **That** means the entire political **machinery** is involved in choosing America's representatives to the IMF &. **WB. That** is number one;

secondly, that the Brettonwood Act **also** says that these executive directors **cannot** function on their own, **independently**. They are supposed to be advised as to how they *ar&* to function in the board by an advisory council. The advisory council would consist of the secretary of the Treasury, that is like our finance minister, the secretary of state, that is like our foreign minister and secretary of commerce that, is like our F'ranab Mukherji and then the chairman of board of reserves, that is like our Rangaraj an, then the chairman of the import

C)

and export bank. These people constitute the advisory committee **that** would advise the members representing the USA **on** how they have to behave in **taking** decisions at IMF *and* WB,, **From** this we know what kinds

c >

of decisions will be **taken**; not only that it also says that when these

people take decisions **the** advisory committee is supposed to submit to the president and congress of the USA semi-annual reports in which they have to **tell** them, not the congress but the President, semi-annual ly what kind of decisions they *are* taking and how they *are* beneficial to the USA. That is number one. Secondly once in two years

this advisory **committee has** to place before **the** entire congress a report, showing how the policies,, international **monetary** and other-policies, financial policies , how they have been beneficial **to** the USA and also **to** the world security. That is the word they use,, world security, world security as perceived by the USA. So we know what **the**¹

C)

mean.these are the political control of the USA on **IMF** and **WB**.**This** we must keep in mind and secondly most of our **economists** forget or **rather**

C^J

they *are* overwhelmed when they see the **theoretical** arguments that *are* advanced in favour of some of the stabilisation and structural adjustment policies. I will come to **that** a little later, but having talked about IMF and WB let me now go to the events that have led to the current, crisis not only in India **but** the entire world,,

One of **the** basic features of IMF was to fix the exchange rates and also to maintain the exchange rates at a stable rate so that there would not be much of a speculation about exchange rate **fluctuating** am

C 3

then capital moving haphazardly between one country *and* another

country. That was supposed to be one of the basic functions of international

monetary policy, according to JM Keynes. And hence the Brettonwoods, actually one identifies a fifth exchange rate as a Brettonwood instrument for stability and security in the financial **economy of** the world. There was a 5th exchange rate prevailing since the inception of IMF and WE< in 1944 until 1973. 1970 onwards USA economy had run into major problems with its own balance of payments and **dollar** because ver]

weak **viz-a** vis the Japanese Yen and the Deutschmark . Until .1970 the

USA was vehemently opposing any introduction **of** a currency other than the dollar or for international transactions. But when they had their **own** problems they realised that they **themselves** needed some other flexible

currency and hence **they** agreed to the? introduction of the special drawing rights. The same country, that was opposing it from 1944 to 1970, in '71 or so in principle had **agreed** to this special drawing rights because of their own problems. Another thing is that. we all know, that the major economic crisis arose in 1973 as a result of the first oil shock. Who was responsible for that oil shock ? USA had been giving economic as well as military aid to Israel to fight the Arab countries. Arab countries could not really fight Israel which **was** backed **by** **LISA** with their own economic potential. So they needed to raise

resources to match the giant economy ~- the USA. They got a brilliant idea that the only way to do that was to use their own **natural** resources namely the oil. Then they formed into a charter and hiked oil prices. The oil price shock of 1973 would not have been there if the USA had not supported Israel and put Israel against Arab countries. To put it in other words the first oil-shock was due to the political gambling or political strategy of USA. In fact if you see any World Bank report today, there was no classification before 1973. After '73 the countries *are* classified into

oil-importing countries and oil exporting countries the reason being

that all of a sudden the oil importing countries **faced** a major shock

as a result of the price rise. In their statistics you will find that the balance of **payment** should be unfavourable to the **oil-importing** countries and favourable **to** oil-exporting countries. That means among a 11 the countries of the world after 1973 a **major** balance of payment crisis arose for those countries importing oil. Fortunately at that time IMF- started working towards giving what is called stabilisation

loans. For all those oil **importing** countries IMF was giving a loan

cope up **with** the BoP problems. The first BoP problems and IMF's **int**ention to solve the **problem started** in '73 which I again attribtrb

c

the USA's political role in supporting Israel. When they were a 1re, struggling and trying to recover, IMF dictated terms to them. Those countries which took loans from IMF" were given certain terms, the < called conditional i. ties under which the loan would be given to **then**

A fellow economist got a Nobel Prize in **1976** for devising those conditionality **instruments for** Latin **American** countries and you may **also** have seen **in** papers that he was instrumental in advising the USA govt **to overdraw** the Chilean govt. Hence in 1976 when that economist, Milton Freedman, was given the **Nobel** Prize there was an **uproar** among the entire economic profession all over the world that why should a Nobel Prize be given to a person who was instrumental in overdrawing Allencle's govt. in Chile. So that was the guy **who** framed the conditionality instruments for IMF' -Milton Freedman. So when some of these countries having no alternatives when they were trying to cope up with the problems, in 1979 another major oil-shock came. The second oil-shock in mag **nitude** was not as big as the first oil-shock. But **over-&~above** the first, oil-shock it had serious **repercussions** in many countries particularly in some of the South American countries which had first an oi 1 -shock , fol lowed by an **IMF** loan -■•■ IMF loan going with some conditionalities, and **conditionalities** were very harsh to them. And when the conditionalities were very harsh, **they** had already taken **IMF** loans and had severe BoP problems, they had a second oil-shock. Soon after that **in** August 1982, **Mexico** declared bankruptcy. You must remember **that** all these IMF loans are sovereign loans, that means they &re loans given by the

IMF **to** the governments of the countries ; they *are* not private loans. What Mexico did was, Mexico in August 1982 had declared that. Mexico had gone bankrupt as a country and that they would **not** be able to honour **the repayment obligation to** IMF on **the** loans they had taken.

By this **time** one examines how IMF' and WB have been operating. **In** the beginning these organisations were operating on a capital that is based on contributions made by member countries in terms of special drawing rights or whatever. Member countries were **making** contributions. **But** what happened from 1970 onwards., IMF &. WB, WB **in** particular started raising capital from **the** capi. tal markets. That means they were taking private **loans** from companies, international banks and so **on**. And putting them as **the** capital of IMF and WB to be given away as loans to countries. It meant not only sovereign capital, but private capital of major **banks** and international banking agencies were involved in IMF and

WE ^ loans. Hence those internatinal banking agents were concerned that their capital was at **stake**. If sovereign nations **declared** bankruptcy then their capital is at stake. They have to write **off**

C

C all that, investment **they** were putting in IMF and WB. So they **put** pressure on the USA government and the USA govt; in turn put pressure on IMF and WB **to** introduce certain conditionalities **so** that this kind of a bankruptcy can **never** take place. To safeguard the returns on their private loans they introduced the notion of

cond i tional i ties«

We? have **to understand the** issue of conditional ities because there

are two sides to it. One side is, they keep telling us, look these conditionalities are meant **for your own** good so **that** you improve your economy, so that you *are* able to repay your loan. That's what they say. The other side of it is that, there is a private capital involved. People who hold the private capital **in** these advanced countries are putting conditions so **that** they can recover money fast. These *are* the two sides; one might say both *are* one and the same. That **is** a different issue, maybe at the **time** of discussions we can talk **about it.** Now this is about, the **con d i t i o n a l i t i e s.**

What happens is that, if you look **at what are the** conditionalities both **in** popular and professional writings, there? is some confu sion **regarding** what is structural adjustment and what is stability. Let me clarify **that** issue, to start with. **Whenever**

there is a BoP problem, like **oil** shock **or** something like that, due

to external problem there is a BoP problem,. **Similarly** there is a huge fiscal deficit, that means govts is borrowing too much from the public and the central bank, then the govt; has **payment** obligations. There is **so** much money created as a result, price level goes **up.** So there *are* two aspects which give rise to an **in** stability in in the economy. One is a BoP deficit and the other is budget deficit and borrowing from the *reserve* bank which **in** creases the price level. In other words inflation and **BoP** problems *are* short term instabilities in any economy. So whenever there *e[^]re* these two problems, BoP deficit and inflation, the economy is supposed to take care of those instabilities by some corrective measures. Any such corrective measures of solving these two problems *are* called stabilisation policies; that means you want to stabilise the economy by removing the instabilities **in BoP** and in price level **or** inflation. With these experinces **of**

'73 and '79 - I hope I am **not** boring you with economics, you

know now-a-days it has become essential to understand some of these basic things because we are in the thin **of** thicks; so many-things *are* happening. I only hope taht you would go back and **edu** cate the common people **all** over the country about the realities of a 11 these **policies.** So when peop **1 e are** educ:ated , **they** are knowledgeable they **can** influence the policies through their **legislatives** and so on,, Hence I don't consider this kind of economics an academic economics that should remain **in the** academic institutes. I think that this economics should percolate

^ :>

to **the** common man. That is why I am taking a **bit** more time **to** go into **the** basics the '73 and '79 experiences of the two oil-shocks made people realise that, perhaps you know that in '79 with the second oil-shock in '82, South **American** countries when t they faced these problems of say Mexico declaring bankruptcy,

what **IMF** did was, they agreed to reschedule the? loans. That means

3

c

th

ey took the **old** loans and they said," Look we will give you another loan, with that loan you would be able to make your payment obiigations- Also we would spread out the loan over a longer period so that you won't **feel the pinch of** repayment". This is the issue of rescheduling the loan.This is what the palm-shot perspective of IMF in our Indian context.So the same taxing,the principle is the same. So they give another loan to do

that. Soon what the lending agencies as well as the receiving agencies felt that, the capacity to repay is so low in some of these countries because their growth is low, their productivity is low, unless they improve their economy by improving their productivity and growth rate of their economies they will not be able to repay **it**. So **it** was felt that these stabilisation policies must be supplemented by certain long term structural adjustments in the economy. Hence the long term structural adjustments in the economy *are* supposed to create improved productivity and rapid growth in the economy. In other words, the major goal of **stabilisation** policies is to reduce the short term imbalances in the BoP deficit and that of inflation. The goal of **structural adjustments** is to create a long term situation which improves the productivity and growth of an economy. This is the distinction between the two.

Let me give examples for the two. **When** in '91 we started our economic policies with reducing budget deficits and on July 4th 1991 we devalued the rupee by about **19.7%**. When we did these two those two instruments were supposed to be the stabilisation instruments. In other words, the devaluation was supposed to reduce our BoP deficits and the reduction of budgetary deficit was supposed to reduce the level of inflation in the economy. So those were stabilisation instruments,

Now what *are* the structural adjustment **mechanisms**? For example the Chelliah Committee Report, Fiscal reforms, financial **sector** reforms and then **liberalisation** of imports and exports. All these

C ->

are supposed to be structural adjustments which *are* aimed at improving the productivity and growth rate of the economy. **Now** I come to the basic issue of the two sides of these policies.

Some of you here perhaps might tell me because I lost track of this. Manmohan Singh held a very important post in Rajiv Gandhi's **government** as ..deputy commissioner of the Planning **Commission** ?? It is very ironic, very surprising that, the crisis we encountered in 1990 and 1991 is due to the policies followed **during** the government of **Rajiv Gandhi** with his **liberalisation** policy from **1980**. **Rajiv Gandhi** pushed liberalisation. If you look at our E^oF statistics - they *are* published by what is called the **Reserve** Bank of India Bulletin, it is a publication that comes every month - if you look **at** the BoP statistics particularly the trade, export & imports and trade balance, you can immediately discover,,

say for **example** before **1980** the **BoP** deficit, was about 80,90, 100,200 crores something of that magnitude. During '80s cumulatively the BoP deficits had gone upto 2000, 3000,4000 crores.

Less—than—two—digit—figures had gone to four digit—figures by **the**

'80s. Pill because liberalised **imports** without giving any incentives, but the business to export. So we were importing much more

c)

than what we were exporting. Secondly in the world market our products were not at all competitive. This was established, there were two articles written in EPW by Indira Rajaram on our export performance where she very clearly demonstrated that small, small

C 3

countries which export garments, like our neighbours where the level of education technology is much worse, have **better** compara **tive** advantage than us in exporting that could be due to two

reasons; either because a **preferential treatment** given by the USA for their textile import or because of our **govts** putting unnecessary restrictions on our **exports and imports. So in other**

C)

words **the** major **BoP** crisis that we face **in** .1990 **was** mostly because of **the** liberalisation policies of Rajiv Gandhi for which Manmohan Singh should share responsibility? because he held a key position at that time. Of course, it is also true that we had the Iraq War and dequotation and several such things added to **it**. But if you look at the dimensions of it the **major** part of the crisis was because of our liberalisation without having an overall comprehensive policy as to how *are* we going to meet that particular BoP problem. There was no attention paid to it at all.

It is unfortunate that I was doing some mathematical & statical economics and I was in an ivory tower? I was not really concerned

c ^

with the real life economic **problem because** that was my specialisation. But the crisis really provoked me to come down and look at these real life problems and **it**. is quite unfortunate that several of my colleagues who deal with such mundane problems on a day-to-day basis have **ignored** this. I blame all my economics

c " >

colleagues who did not warn in 1980s that, if we were to follow **such** policies as were being followed that we would very soon end up in very huge **BoP** problems. They should have warned the govt: The economic advisors and people who are well known economist, to advise the planning commission; all these people., I make them accountable, I blame myself for not having paid attention to these problems although I had been in the country. There *&r&* several people, perhaps like me who *are* qualified, competent economists, who *are* not concerned with the problems. So the whole profession has to be blamed for not warning the government, because of that we ran into the crisis. Not because planning as a mechanism has failed.

We keep hearing today that market, socialism is lost, communism is

C ->

lost that planning is lost, they *are* all useless. They have gone by the way side because they did not deliver the goods and they *a.r&* useless and the only panacea for all problems is free-market

mechanism. This is **what** we *ars* told. In my view all this is **nan**

sense, there *are* political reasons, the economic foundations *are* very sound with our planning system, economic foundations *are* very sound with Marxism, economic: foundations *are* very sound with Market Socialism. If some of these

institutes have failed, they failed not because of the economics but they failed because of the politics. This is what made me realise that the interface between economics and politics is so strong that **people** like (the) who were **confining** themselves to economics and not looking at the

c j

political side have done a great injustice to both economics and to the real life problems for centuries and they continue to do so. That's why I am coming out in the open.

Please remember that our problem crisis was because of the economic liberalisation policies and not because of a failure of our planning. Nothing perhaps will reassure you about what I said than our own experience in the past before 1990. Didn't we **have** a war with China ? Didn't we have war with Pakistan ? Didn't we

survive all those things,, major crises ? When we survived all those crises, didn't we have a planning mechanism in our country? That means our planning mechanism was sound enough *and* in fact. whenever they **felt** the planning mechanism was coming in the¹ way, we gave a **small** planning holiday also, you may remember. When we had a major crisis of having two droughts **consecutively** following the war with Pakistan in '66- '67 we gave a plan holiday. Not that we gave up planning altogether,, we? gave a holiday because it required some kind of an emergency planning to recover from the crisis. So what we need is perhaps a plan holiday or a complete? turn around of the-? planning process rather **than** giving up planning altogether. Now what people were saying was ,throw the baby with **the bath** water, **forget** about planning altogether. That is not sufficient. Lot **of** people give the wrong impression **to** the contribution made by **Prof.** PC Mahalonobis to the planning process. If one look at his major contribution, it ia a managerial contribution, it is a problem solving contribution. What he did was, to see what *are* our Strengths, what *are* our Weaknesses, what are our Opportunities, what are our Threats. *In* management, in corporate management when they talk about strategies, when they come up with strategies they look for what is *called* SWOT analysis. SWOT stands for Strengths, Weakness, Opportunities and **Threats.** What Mahalonobis did was precisely **that**'; what *are* our strengths, our weaknesses, opportunities and threats. He said let us build up on our strengths, let us play down our weaknesses, let's use our opportunities, let us be aware of our threats. That was his strategy *and* in today's world if we were given a task the same strategy would apply but what were strength at that time were different. Those strengths *are* perhaps

our weaknesses now, like our public sector,, So if planning process as a mechanism is very much essential, this a point 1 would like to make.

Now let me come to the policies that *are* pressed on us. What is the merit of those policies, let me **examine** one **by** one. Let me look at the devaluation, devaluation programme was *meant* to increase our exports **and** to reduce our imports,, Now if you examine actually what has actually happened after devaluation **is** that our essential imports were curtailed because of devaluation. But our exports have not picked up after devaluation As a result the industrial production has gone down terribly after devaluation the growth rate has **plummeted** from 4 % points to 1.5% points as a result of devaluation. Look at the fiscal deficit problem, fiscal deficit was reduced. Now it is well-known

C ' ^

for **people** like me that if you focus on one target and try to work only on that target with one-? instrument you can play games. and achieve the target. But we have to see what *are* the general implications of that. We reduce the fiscal deficits, we reduce the price level from 13»7% to 77., But what happens to the rest of

c -)

the economy ? When fiscal **deficit** was reduced, it was reduced -you can **examine the** budget documents- you **will** notice that govt: expenditure is

reduced because the govt: stopped investing. Govt;

c^J

stopped putting investment **in** agriculture, govt; reduced sub sidi.es. Price level was kept alright **but** there were other **ramifications**. **Investment** is reduced, growth is *reduced*; subsidies *are* **reduced** so the poor **people** lost in the bargain.

These *are* the things **to** be kept **in** mind. This **is** about stab.il is a on **policies**, I have given a brief introduction. What has happened

C 1

to the structural adjustment policies ? Regarding structural adjustment let us look at the so called liberalisation; I can give you a few examples to illustrate what is currently happening through liberalisation policies. We know that our production structures *are* such that,, in India it is labour intensive, in America it is capital intensive. Now for every 1000 Dove soaps that *are* sold in India perhaps one worker is supported in America But if those 1000 Dove Soaps *are* replaced by 1000 Hamam soaps it may support 3 labourers in India. So when you *are* talking about importing goods from a capital intensive country into a labour-intensive country you *are* **replacing** goods., you *are* replacing more labour. In order to support a few labourers in America, we are replacing many more labourers in our country by this kind of a liberalisation. By liberalisation you *are* removing the so-called protection that, we have given .to our industry for a long **long** time. Under the protective environment our industry has

c ?

become very inefficient. **But** no economist who is worth anything has; examined whether there is really any inefficiency **in** our economy. If **at** all there *are* any inefficiency what *are* **the** reasons for it. I don't consider the inefficiency in our business

C 3

and industry is **not** because of the protection. It **is** because of administrative prices, it is because of labour union problems possibly, it may be because of lack of reliable power source, it may be because of poor transportation *and* communication infrastructure etc. In other words we can improve our business and industry not necessarily by liberalising imports and removing

protection but instead by improving the

infrastructure. Power, transport, **communications** \$ let the govt: get out of the whole business of raising revenues through administered prices. Lot of our budgetary resources are generated through administered prices without a proper legislative procedure. They find it very convenient to adjust the budget, not

) " facing the parliament but outside the budgetary session, by

tinkering with the administered prices. Nobody has raised a voice against this totally unparliamentary approach of our govt; in raising resources - administered prices. Nobody has raised sufficient voice to tell the govt: that our business and industry

(^

are not being protected. What our business and industry needs is

better support from the govt: through infrastructure roads,

communications etc. So it is my view that it is a non-sensical argument that they *are* putting through our throat, namely that we have to remove the protection to industry and liberalise imports. Why *are* they saying it, they *are* saying it because, you know what is happening in a country like our economy. They have reached a kind of saturation level in their level of consumption. Their population level has stabilised, so the number of people *are* not growing and per **capita** consumption of an individual has reached a saturation. In other words the domestic demand in a country like America has reached a saturation level. How can such an economy grow? It can grow only if they can export. How will they export, they will export only if countries

like ours will allow those exports to come here as exports. So they *are* pushing through **IMF** as conditionalities liberalisation of imports and they call them structural adjustment policies to improve our growth performance. But the ulterior motive is -they *are* facing unemployment **problems**, they *are* facing recession **and** problems and they want markets abroad to sell their goods. That, is why they *are* asking their representatives **on IMF & WB** to push as **conditionalities** some of these policies under the label of structural adjustment. And we are all told these *are* for our own benefit.

Another thing is **that** we *are* not alone ; there *are* several countries **that** have **been** given this dose by **IMF & WB** as stabilisation and structural adjustment,, A lot. of Latin American countries have gone through it, a lot of **American** countries have gone through **it**. And some; of the **East-Asian** countries have gone through it. But is **that** IMF and WB keep telling us, you must

c ?

have heard **that** nobody now a days talk about what **happened** in South America p nobody talks about what, happened in Africa **but** everyone talks about East-Asian miracle. There is a latest book put out by WE!, " The East-Asian Miracle". This is all a propaganda. Why is it that **they are** not talking about why has it failed in South America, why these policies failed in Africa. What is the guarantee that these policies are followed in India that we do not go to the route of either South **American** countries

L J

or African countries ? What is the guarantee that we would do like the **East-Asian** countries ? How it has been already more than

2 1/2 to 3 years since we have initiated the liberalisation **policies**. To my mind there is no single guarantee so far that **our** liberalisation experience will land us in a fortunate **situation** like that of the East **Asian** countries. And most of **my** fellow

c , ?

economists have failed to analyse and sift the experiences of these countries to give us a wisdom as to what is it that we should not be doing so that we can avoid the South American experience; what is it that we should do to emulate the East-Asian wisdom, that kind of a wisdom is not coming either from the

) WE^ or from the **so-called** economic advisors you hear a lot.

about.You ask them these basic questions, they have no answers. 1

asked them myself whenever I faced; you know there are some of our people like Prof.Sreenivasan, professor of Economics at Yale University, Prof., Jagdish **Bhagawati**, professor of Economics at Columbia University in USA. They were commissioned by Maninohan Singh to 'write about our structural reforms,- They wrote a paper. I

will give you a simple illustration, in that paper they say that our country can borrow very heavily from IMF and WB at the rate of 8% interest. Their argument is they use some kind of statistical calculation and they show in our country rate of return to investment is more than 12%. So they say in our economy we can borrow at 8% because rate of return to investment in our country

is 12% and that advise they *are* giving to Manmohan Singh to borrow from IMF and WB. See the trick here ■• when the govt. of India borrows from IMF and WB it is a **sovereign** debt, it is the

govt: that has to repay not the country,, See the catch here, it is the govt: that has to repay when they *are* taking a loan at 8%.

It is private industries that make .12% or more returns, taut how is **govt** going to get 12% to pay IMF & WB at 8% interest ? A govt: that is continuously incurring a deficit over several years, how can it raise resources to pay back at 8% ? That entire paper doesn't talk about it. There is a -very rich experience of Korea and Japan. A lot of these international agencies tell us " privatise,, state roust withdraw and market forces must take over". If you examine the record of South Korea and Japan they have succeeded because of state intevention, not because of market forces. There is a ministry in Japan called **MIT I**, ministry of industry , trade? and something. That ministry gives guidance to the industry as to which direction it should go for the next ten years. For the first ten **years** they work on electronics, for the **next** ten years they work on auto mobiles. If Japan had a competitive advantage over electronics and automobiles in the world **market** that is because of the state intervention, the stae giving a clear-cut direction to the economy of the industry. **Has** our country anything like that ? After structural adjustment when we talk about export growth and so on did our country during the last 2 i/2 •••■ 3 years give any directions as to how we **should** go, which industries we should **promote** so that we can increase our export ? Nothing has come; you ask Manmohan Singh, you ask any of these people. There is no action plan, there is no blue print of what it all means. Not only that I say you go and read Challiah Committee report, you go

read Narasimham Committee report, **tax** reforms and financial sector reforms. I can show you **page** by page sentence by sentence what is reported there is copies of internal documents of IMF, These were all actually dictated, these people were chosen to write things which *are* convenient. What have we done as people interested in our country ? Very 1i111e,,

Fortunately for us 1 would say inspite of all **the** govt. influence professionals try to keep some kind of *an* indictment. As a result I am very happy to see that both people working in the WB,IMF and

at the UN organisations such as ILO, **UNDP** etc have written very objective reports which are very very illuminating. Because you are all interested in documentation, I would like to **just** place before you that there are several country experiences that **are** brought out by **ILO**, **UNDP** and this journal put out by WB,, " WB Economic Review", " WB Research Observer"., These profes sionals *are* not shack led;they would not like to be shackled by anybody. They *are* writing quite objectively. **For** WB publications

has put down that the views expressed *are* those of the authors and not those of the organisations where they work for.. That it self is a clear indication that they *are* speaking the truth. My own suggestion to all of you is when you document please look **at** the experience and tell our people? what has been the experience i n o t h e r c o u n t r i e s.

Economic growth of a country depends on prudent investment. Investment will get good returns when it is combined with ours and

what **is** provided by the Government, for example **Power**. If I am asked whether these 3 years has created any real assets, then my

answer **is no**. A **monetary** investment *anti* **the** number of stock must be related **to** real Investment for equity capital,, If a company-has no plan **for** growth then it has no equity. The number of people who want, to buy equity have increased. **Foreign** people want

it to happen that way. More money **chasing** less prices, then share

prices rise up. They have to come down . In an economy where there is **no growth** there is speculation. Here foreigners come, asking **for** liberalisation. They can have and taut stock from stock

market and make profits, converts them **to** dollars and take it back. This **is** what happened **in** Africa and Latin America. 'Beam happened **in** Chile, Turkey, Philipinnes and much before and still we kept quite about. Lessons had to be learnt and been cautious. Foreign banks *are* the ones which provoke the brokers and fuel these activities with speculation. This real investment is made when the macro economic environment is good and not when they have a doubt.

Who will invest if there is no dependable power, communication, political and economic instability **policies**. Now why some countries succeeded and why some failed then it shows that it is those countries which have paid attention to power and other things, which have had properly spelt out policies and structure.

People **form** an optimistic expectation in such an environment. So in last 3 years no real investment have taken place and no foreign investment schenies have materialised till now as they *arm*

not happy with the things in India. **Still** they have imposed policies. Even if **tomorrow** something happens they know that they can take power of stock. Given all this the kind of strategy good

for us from our perspective. In 1990 we had an alternative to declare bankruptcy arid should have asked what is that by which the economy could bounce back on its own. It is *never* too late, we can still correct our policies.

Discussions:

Samuel ; Throughout your analysis you have criticised the Structural Adjustment Programmes **and** the government, but your ending was like that of World Bank and International Monetary Fund. They say that health is yours and profit is Mai 1ya's.

Prof; What is the role of state **in** the economy? Look, World **Bank** and the International Monetary Fund will create a new stance on pricing, for example education. But in .1994 America has itself changed its policies of education. Clinton administration is more for state instrumentation. If you want to promote private investment first Public sector should do the investment. Their *are* something only Public sector should do and can do. There *a.rs* something that **only** public sectors can do, for **example**, Roads, Railways. **Entry** of private

sector into these fields makes equity lose. World

Bank says that only primary health should be by the government1 sector. and curative medicine should be by **the private In America** today worry about a meritorious, student need **not** his educational expenses. The state care of it. But they *are* forcing India today to reduce the **in** the investment takes full But they *are* forcing India today to reduce the **in** the public **utilities** and welfare sector. This

is double standards,

CP Jayalakshmi: Their is fellowships **in** India also. Americans give loan to the students and tell they give free education. It is a policy where they *are* **not** charged directly but are caught from the back.

Samueli Intervention of market and foreign capital is good and 50 is foreign capita 1?

Prof: **Economic** theory and economic paradigm is that there is a market **mechanism** and a state. **The** state is there for the poor and market for others. It might be wrong also. State as an institution work discriminately also, many a times and it is always not necessary that free market forces are always bad for the economy. But the chances *are* more that there *are* private individuals who would weild control and not. help the poor. It is surprising that Keynes underplays the role of the state. If the state favour the rich it is demoralisation. Thus it is also a moral force than to say that the state is useless.

Lakshmi Henon; Why is International Monetary Fund money-called as an aid and not as a loan?

Prof: **I**n t e r n a t i o n a l m o n e y t h a t c o m e s t h r o u g h t h e s e i n s t i t u

tions *are* always called aid. Aid and Loans *are* two dif

ferentl things. But their is a link between aid and loan. Aid is a bait for the people telling them that trade will improve. There is also a tendency to call them as aid **because** they are charged a lower rate of intrest,,

MohanDoss: What is the political declares itself as bankrupt?
impact when the country

Profs If people were all motivated, well informed and made it impossible to go for an IMF loan then there will be a coup if intellectuals put pressure. In a global scenario when there are small countries which *are* weak in such a situation where there is no alternative and we are stuck with a super power and not that of an alternative. People should form a coalition of countries and say that we *are* a group and wo should not be ignored.

Munira Sens Have you realised the nexus between change in government and a country economy?

Prof: With continuous change in the political set-up there is no political stability. When there is no political stability people and the foreign investors *are* scared of investing .